BIRD'S-EYE VIEW OF GROUP PLAN FOR PUBLIC BUILDINGS IN CLEVELAND, LOOKING NORTH
GROUP PLAN OF PUBLIC BUILDINGS OF THE CITY OF CLEVELAND, SHOWING SURROUNDINGS, APPROACHES, PARKWAYS AND PLEASURE GROUNDS
DETAIL PLAN OF FOUNTAIN AT SOUTH END OF MALL, WITH TREATMENT OF GARDENS, TERRACES, FORMAL TREES AND REFLECTING POOL.
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND OHIO. BY EDWARD A. ROBERTS

The traveler along the southern shore of Lake Erie is immediately impressed with the splendid location of the city of Cleveland, and recognizes at once the far sightedness of its founder, General Moses Cleaveland, the Connecticut surveyor who established a trading post at the mouth of the Cuyahoga River in 1796 as a basis for what is now the metropolis of Ohio and the seventh city in the United States. Time was when the humorously inclined were prone to refer to Cleveland as an overgrown village or summer resort affording a convenient resting place between New York and Chicago. Within the confines of the city of to-day and its connecting suburbs there are seventy-one square miles of territory, containing a population estimated at half a million and sustaining industrial enterprises which in character and volume of output are nowhere equaled in the world. With many other American cities, however, Cleveland has suffered from rapid growth. It is significant of all the larger cities that opportunities for development along artistic lines have been all but lost in the absorbing rush of commercialism. Now that these cities are getting their second breath, as it were, they are beginning to realize the possibilities they possess for advancement in civic beauty. It is only in the last ten or a dozen years that this movement toward retrieving opportunities has given promise of becoming general. It received a great impetus from the White City at Chicago in 1893, which demonstrated the remarkably pleasing effects to be obtained by orderly arrangement of structures, harmoniously designed, and all made to correspond to the educated fancy of a master mind. Other expositions in more recent years have accelerated the movement, until now there is scarcely a municipality of any consequence that does not have a select coterie of artists, architects and public spirited citizens joined in societies or represented by commission, busily engaged with plans for civic betterment. A leading exponent of these local bodies is the American Civic Association, which will meet in Cleveland in October. It is appropriate that this association should visit the Forest City at this time, for there is no other city in the country that represents so interesting and profitable a study to careful critics of municipal affairs. In addition to being one of the best governed cities in America, it is fulfilling the dreams of its most altruistic inhabitants
in carrying out a line of public improvements remarkable for their plan and scope. Cleveland is performing the maximum possible task within its debt limit and is proving that the average citizen is not averse to large expenditures when convinced that his dollars are being wisely placed.

FOREMOST in point of national, and to a certain extent international interest, is the extraordinary improvement the city is now executing in the way of a group plan of public buildings. Strange as it may seem, this big municipality occupies rented quarters for its municipal offices, has no central public library building, except a temporary structure of slight cost, occupies rented quarters for its educational department, has a union passenger station that is a disgrace to the community, houses its county offices and courts in an antiquated stone building insufficient for its use, and until recently had a federal building better situated for the needs of half a century ago than the present day. This being the peculiar situation that has confronted the city, a movement has been in progress for several years among Cleveland architects and citizens for taking advantage of the conditions and erecting buildings, not only attractive and beautiful individually, but so arranged as to provide an harmonious and beautiful group. Under the auspices of the Cleveland Architectural Club in March, 1895, a competition was instituted upon the grouping of Cleveland public buildings. One of the judges in this competition, the late Prof. Charles F. Olney, followed up the suggestion by introducing a resolution in the Cleveland Chamber of Commerce, creating a committee on grouping plan in January, 1899. This committee has taken a leading part in all subsequent developments. Already initial steps had been taken for erecting new municipal and county buildings, and it was found that the commissions having these matters in hand were favorably inclined toward the group idea. In public meetings and through the newspaper press encouragement was freely given to the enterprise. At the convention of the Architectural League of America, held in Cleveland in June, 1899, a paper upon the subject was presented by Mr. H. K. Bush-Brown of New York, the public being invited to the meeting. A little later Mr. John M. Carrere of New York, delivered an illustrated lecture upon the topic before the Chamber of Commerce, showing what had been done in
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND

this line by the older cities of Europe, and suggesting the possibilities in Cleveland. At the instance of the Chamber of Commerce a State law was enacted providing for the appointment of a board of supervision by the Governor of the State, bringing the services of three architects of national prominence to bear upon the subject. Governor Nash under provisions of this bill appointed as members of the commission Mr. Daniel H. Burnham of Chicago, architect of the Columbian Exposition; Mr. John M. Carrere of New York, architect of the Pan-American Exposition, and Mr. Arnold W. Brunner, architect of the new federal building in Cleveland. After devoting a year's study to the group plan idea, this board presented an elaborate report, accompanied by drawings, which at once met with popular favor and upon which the present improvements are proceeding.

THE most important of these drawings is of course the ground plan, a reduced copy of which is presented with this article. The entire group plan, exclusive of parks, embraces about nineteen acres of land, which lie close to the business heart of the city. The axis of the plan is Wood street extending from Superior street to the lake front. It is proposed to make of Wood street a mall upwards of 500 feet in width. At the southerly end of this mall will be located the federal building, now in process of construction, and the public library building, the former on the westerly side and the latter on the easterly side. At the northerly end of the mall is to be located a monumental union passenger station, the vestibule to the city of Cleveland, this to be situated nearest of all the buildings to the lake. A little to the south of this building are to be located the city hall and the court house, balancing the structures at the southerly end of the avenue, the court house to be on the westerly side and the city hall on the easterly side of the axis, each of these buildings to front directly on streets parallel with Wood street. It is proposed to transform Wood street into an imposing Court of Honor, lined if possible with dignified and harmonious architecture, this avenue to be improved with formal clipped trees, parkings, flower beds, fountains and statuary.

As for the high character of the undertaking, the supervising architects made the following comment: "When the scheme is developed it will recall in part many of the fine avenues we point to with
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND

pleasure, such as the Champs Elysees in Paris, or the Esplanade in Nancy. In many of these minor details, in the arrangement of the trees and the inner court, the Palais Royal gives a fair suggestion of the sort of beauty aimed at. The Sunken Garden of the Luxembourg, with its wonderful treatment of rosebushes and flower beds on the sloping surfaces, suggests what can be done with the sunken garden in the middle of the Mall and the Esplanade.

"The Commission recommends that the design of all the buildings of this group plan should be derived from the historic motives of the classic architecture of Rome; that one material should be used throughout, and that a uniform scale of architecture should be maintained in their design. The cornice line of the principal buildings should be uniform in height, and the general mass and height of all the buildings on the east and west of the Mall should be the same; in fact, these buildings should be of the same design and as uniform as possible. The same conditions of design should apply to the buildings on the north of Lake street between Erie and Seneca Streets.

"It must be remembered that the architectural value of these buildings does not alone lie in their immediate effect upon the beholder, but much more in their permanent influence on all building operations of the city. An example of order, system and reserve, such as is possible here, will be for Cleveland what the Court of Honor of 1893 was for the entire country, and the influence will be felt in all subsequent building operations, both public and private."

A COMPANION plan presented with the report shows the section of the city in which the public buildings are to be located and also describes the streets and blocks of land to be occupied. Already the city and county have purchased four entire blocks of property upon which the court house and city hall are to be erected, these four blocks being situated on the lake front overlooking Lake View Park and the lake itself. These blocks are 581 feet in length, and 261½ feet in width, and contain, including the streets surrounding them, nine acres. Lake View Park contains ten and a half acres, and lies beyond these blocks and the tracks of the Lake Shore Railway. Beyond these railway tracks will be a park of land, made from dumpings, of about thirty-four acres, almost one-half of which is now filled in and ready for improvement. The cost of these blocks to
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND

the city and county is about $1,650,000. This comparatively low cost was due to the fact that the locality was characterized by many dilapidated buildings and questionable resorts. Several large parcels of property on Wood street have been purchased for the widening of that street into the proposed mall, and with the purchase of property from the Case estate, now pending at cost of $1,900,000, a greater part of the land needed for the entire grouping plan will be acquired. It is not designed to follow immediately the recommendation of the supervising architects to purchase all of the land between Bond street on the east, Superior street on the south, Seneca street on the west and the lake on the north, although this may come in the near future, notwithstanding the fact that it will require about $3,000,000 additional outlay. There has been considerable speculation as to the entire expenditure involved in the plan. Perhaps the best analysis of its probable cost was made by the grouping plan committee of the Chamber of Commerce, composed of prominent business men, who figured it out as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land for City Hall</td>
<td>$686,046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land for County Building</td>
<td>$917,279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of City Hall</td>
<td>$1,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of County Building</td>
<td>$3,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Library Building</td>
<td>$1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of land for widening Wood street</td>
<td>$2,475,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of land required for control, which may be resold by the city with restrictions in deed</td>
<td>$2,875,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of improvement of Mall and Explanade</td>
<td>$899,780</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total first cost** | **$13,853,105**

Since these figures were made it has developed that the city hall may cost nearer $2,500,000 than the estimate, making the total **$14,853,105**.

There are certain considerations relative to these figures to which the committee invited attention. In the first place, they were of the opinion that the land purchased by the city for the purpose of controlling the development of the plan can be re-sold at the same or a better figure than its original cost. Perhaps, in view of the restrictions which the city would put upon the character of the buildings to be erected, it would be safer to assume that there would be no financial profit for the city in this real estate transaction. But in any event,
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND

there may be deducted from the ultimate cost to the city of the Group Plan the sum of $2,875,000, reducing the total cost to $11,978,105. The city would, of course, receive fair compensation from the railroads for any land ceded to them for depot purposes, and any money or the value of the land thus received in compensation for land now within the boundaries of the group would be applied in still further reducing the total cost of the project.

As for progress on the buildings themselves, the preliminary draw-

ings have been made for the new court house and specifications are being written upon which bids will be received for actual work. The preliminary drawings for the city hall are also nearing completion in the office of a local architect, J. Milton Dyer. The buildings are both made to conform to the ideas of the supervising architects, who recommend in their report that the classic style be followed in the entire group of structures. The federal building is well under way, the corner stone having been laid with impressive ceremonies late in May. This building will be of granite, and being lo-
CIVIC ART IN CLEVELAND

cated directly upon the Public Square, will form a splendid advertisement to the city’s notable attractions. Plans for the public library have not yet been drawn, but a movement is in progress to combine this building with the Board of Education headquarters and push the project for the erection of the joint building as rapidly as possible the coming year. A bond issue of $500,000 has been made for the public library, but this will need to be considerably increased to obtain the kind of a building desired. Tentative plans have been prepared for the new union station and trackage to be located in accordance with the general plan, but no definite steps have been taken by either the railroad or the city toward arriving at a satisfactory basis of transferring the necessary land required for the site. There is a disposition, however, on the part of both sides to deal fairly, so that the supervising commission is confident of the ultimate fruition of the plan as outlined.

MARKED attention is being accorded the Cleveland grouping plan by other cities of the country and by a number of foreign cities. Improvements similar to those in Cleveland are being considered in Washington, Harrisburg, St. Louis, Buffalo, New Orleans, San Francisco, Chicago, Baltimore, Detroit, Boston, Ottawa and one or two other cities where in some degree grouping plans for public buildings or kindred movements are being agitated. The city of Manila is about to undergo a physical regeneration along the same lines, an expert investigation of its artistic possibilities having been recently made for the government by Mr. Daniel H. Burnham. The drawings presented by the grouping plan commission of Cleveland have been exhibited in various parts of the country, and reproductions have been presented to the American Institute of Architects, the students of Harvard College, and other universities and associations. The greatest honor that has yet been accorded them was the award of a gold medal by the St. Louis Exposition for groups of architecture. Copies of the report issued by the commission have been in such great demand that almost 2,000 have been distributed to civic societies and municipal authorities, seeking ideas for application in various parts of this country and abroad.

In the way of buildings other than those associated in the grouping plan, a new art museum, to cost between $1,000,000 and $1,500,000 is
being planned to be erected in Wade Park on the site given for this purpose by Mr. and Mrs. J. H. Wade, the funds for this building having been provided by bequests made by former wealthy men of the city, and are known as the Huntington, the Hurlburt and the Kelly art funds. A new market house, to cost approximately from $500,000 to $750,000 will be erected next year on the west side, plans for which are being drawn by local architects.

As the result of a vigorous campaign for lessening the danger from surface railroad crossings, the present city administration, through numerous conferences with the railway officials, has succeeded in having plans made and approved for the elimination of all such crossings in the city, numbering about one hundred. A law has been passed authorizing this action, one-half of the cost to be paid by the city and one-half by the railroads. The street railroads do not contribute. By making concessions with the steam railway companies, not detrimental to the city’s interest, a basis has been agreed upon which calls for an expenditure of about sixty per cent. by these companies, thus reducing the city’s share. Already several grade crossings have been abolished, and work is progressing on others. An idea of the cost of these improvements calculated to save life and limb is gained by reference to the plans for the Pennsylvania railroad, whose crossings have been divided into five groups, the total estimated expenditure being $4,150,000 for doing away with the crossings of this company alone. As a means of relieving congestion in street car travel, a subway has been proposed for the down town district, and is being considered by the Chamber of Commerce. Cleveland has no elevated railway and no underground railway as yet, all travel being on surface roads. Through the efforts of the special committee of the Chamber of Commerce a New York expert has made a study of the problem. The Cleveland park and boulevard system, designed by the eminent landscape artist E. W. Bowditch, of Boston, is the pride of the people of the city. Embracing as it does several of the most picturesque and attractive public pleasure grounds in the country, linked together by the spacious and well-kept drives, the system is as unique as it is charming. It is proposed to complete some of the connecting boulevards not yet made, the present year, and also to build additional shore protections, shelter houses, bridges, etc., the cost of this work to be about $500,000.
UNITED STATES POST OFFICE, CUSTOM HOUSE AND COURT HOUSE, CLEVELAND, OHIO
MR. W. J. SPRINGBORN, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SERVICE AT CLEVELAND, OHIO
SOME GRILLES SHOWING THE BEAUTY OF IRONWORK IN FLANDERS